## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT MIDDLE DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

JOHN BARTOLI, :

: CIVIL ACTION NO. 3:13-0724

**Plaintiff** 

•

v. (JUDGE MANNION)

NOVARTIS PHARMACEUTICALS CORPORATION, :

Defendant :

## ORDER

In light of the memorandum issued this same day, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT defendant's motion to exclude specific causation testimony, (Doc. 159), is DISMISSED IN PART, GRANTED IN PART, AND DENIED IN PART. Defendant's motion is DISMISSED as moot as to Drs. Adonizio, Bruno, Decker, Falcone, Rybka, and Specter. Defendant's motion is GRANTED as to the specific causation testimony of Dr. Timothy Atkinson. Defendant's motion is DENIED as to specific causation testimony of Dr. Arthur Meyer, Dr. Robert Marx, and Dr. Diane Stern.

s/ Malachy E. Mannion
MALACHY E. MANNION
United States District Judge

Date: April 17, 2014

O:\Mannion\shared\MEMORANDA - DJ\CIVIL MEMORANDA\2013 MEMORANDA\13-0724-01-order.wpd